

that hasn't happened yet. This anthology might serve as a warning to urban historians to stop attending panel discussions and get to work.

Christopher ARMSTRONG,  
York University.

\* \* \*

MANOLY R. LUPUL. — *The Roman Catholic Church and the North-West School Question: A Study in Church-State Relations in Western Canada, 1875-1905*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1974.

PAUL CRUNICAN. — *Priests and Politicians, Manitoba Schools and the Election of 1896*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1974.

It is ironical that the little white prairie school house, so humble and unassuming in aspect, could precipitate a controversy capable of shaking the country to its political and cultural foundations. The story begins in the 1870's when the federal government made provisions for the continuance of denominational schools in the West to accommodate the Catholic and largely French-speaking population. But by 1890 the native born were a minority, and the newcomers, mostly English-speaking Protestants, began to press for their own distinctive educational institution, the public school. The result was the clash of both religious and ethnic loyalties in a conflict that inevitably drew the Roman Catholic Church into politics. It was a classic colonial situation: the western hierarchy assisted materially by their Quebec brethren, appealing to the "imperial" authorities at Ottawa to help protect their indigenous institutions from the encroaching colonists. In the process the lines separating Church and State, never distinct in Canada, became very blurred indeed.

Despite the importance and peculiarly Canadian nature of the church-state issue that emerged in the western school questions, Canadian historians have never had the advantage of full-length, dispassionate, and authoritative studies on the subject. We are now indebted to Professors Lupul and Crunican for filling this gap. Their books will remain the standard works for years to come.

Much of their strength lies in the thoroughness of the research. In addition to the personal papers of the main political figures and the representative newspapers, both authors have made extensive use of new material in ecclesiastical archives across the country. Both books have useful annotated bibliographies and appendices. Lupul prints the eleven versions of the controversial education clause of the 1905 Autonomy Bill, showing its amendments by churchmen and politicians. Crunican's detailed tabulations of election results in Quebec, 1891-96, provide a wealth of information for those seeking their own conclusions about the significance of the 1896 election.

Each book makes a singular and valuable contribution to Canadian history, but their usefulness is enhanced if taken together, because they complement each other so well both by virtue of the contrasting nature of the two school questions and by the different approaches of the authors.

Lupul's book is primarily a contribution to western history. His main characters are the western churchmen Taché, Langevin, Legal, Grandin, "Premier" Haultain, Protestant and Catholic spokesman like Frank Oliver and Charles Rouleau. He ferrets the school debates of the Territorial Assembly out of the *Regina Leader* and the correspondence of the representatives. Despite the lack of Haultain papers, Lupul draws a comprehensive and integrated picture of the talented prairie leader.

Crunican, an easterner, is concerned with the impact of the Manitoba school question at the national level. The period from the passage of the offending public school Act to the fateful Brophy decision is treated in a brief introductory chapter. The main thrust of the

book is "to discover how Quebecers, civil and ecclesiastical, were reacting to a key problem of French Canadian rights outside Quebec". The main characters are the Quebec bishops and the politicians Laurier, Tupper, Bowell, Chapleau and Angers. Laurier is a central figure in both books, and readers can compare his determined consistency on the territorial issue with his troubled and ambivalent Manitoba policy. Neither book contains much in the way of fanatics or heroes. Extremists are explained away or ignored and events take care of the would-be heroes.

Both books agree that the bishops, both east and west, had nearly as much trouble agreeing upon common objectives and strategies as the politicians. Crunican, however, implies that in Manitoba the French hierarchy and Irish laity spoke as one voice. In the North-West, Lupul finds no such unanimity. Western Métis, Irish and repatriated French Catholics showed a disconcerting toleration for the public school. Perhaps this partly accounts for the apathy to the school question which is a persistent theme in Lupul. It's still evident: two recent popular histories of Alberta and Saskatchewan don't mention schools at all.

Although Lupul's basic issue is ultimately a political one — "the establishment of the political principle that in a representative democracy the majority must rule, exerting popular control over the institutions of society" —, his book is very much about schools. Unlike the Manitoba case, this political principle was not won in a single, dramatic confrontation arising from the abolition of tax-supported separate schools, but by the much more protracted process of secularizing denominational schools through administrative fiat. Throughout this complicated administrative process Lupul keeps his reader alert to the subtleties that determine a school's definition as separate, Catholic, public, dual, confessional or mixed. Moreover, he also provides, through his sources, a comprehensive survey of the reasons men divide politically on the issue of education. Taken together, they add up to a Catholic view of a corporate, God-centred society and a Protestant vision of voluntarism, accountability and individual rights.

Crunican's book is not about schools, but the politics of remedialism in central Canada. His brilliant analysis of the civil and ecclesiastical response to this radically divisive issue sheds light on most of the main themes and relationships that make up our political history: the tensions existing in and between the parties; federal-provincial dynamics; east-west alliances; the clash and collaboration of French and English, Protestant and Catholic. In dealing with his central theme of church-state relations, Crunican examines what happens not only when priests bring pressure to bear on politicians, but when politicians have to rely on priests to fulfill a political function. His conclusions, worked out in an analysis of the pivotal 1896 election in Quebec, are destined to be much quoted, and should finally bury the simplicities of the "race over religion" interpretation.

In Lupul's book, one is left with the impression that in the end right prevails and justice wins through. Crunican's book is more melancholy. It shows how fragile a concept is Canadian nationhood, and how the strain of a fundamental issue compromises the principles of the best-intentioned men. In 1896 Tupper attempts to hold his party together by the artful muddling of Conservative policy; Laurier, by the skillful articulation of Liberal non-policy. Moderate, large-visioned men like David Mills are defeated, while Clarke Wallace increases his majority. In Quebec, the "devoted, limited men" in the Conservative party are all defeated.

It's a pity that two such excellent books will be so little read. Neither makes any concessions to the amateur or the imperfectly-informed. The chronological and detailed reporting of personal correspondence involving a cast of hundreds, many of whom remain grey and shadowy figures (like Henry Bourassa), conduces more to authenticity than to readability. Occasionally Lupul allows his spokesmen to wander off topic and introduce extraneous material; in other paragraphs it is difficult to distinguish between the author

and his source. He also has some curious textual omissions such as the composition of The Northwest Territories Council and the relevant sections of the 1901 school ordinance which later became part of the Sifton amendment. Because they are so intimate with their subjects, neither author feels constrained to emphasize the crucial over the less significant. Nevertheless, the merits of the books more than compensate for the difficulty in reading them.

D.A. LAWR,  
University of Western Ontario.

\* \* \*

IRVING ABELLA, ed. — *On Strike: Six Key Labour Struggles in Canada 1919-1949*. Toronto: James Lewis and Samuel, 1974.

DAVID JAY BERCUSON. — *Confrontation at Winnipeg: Labour, Industrial Relations and the General Strike*. Montreal and London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1974.

MICHAEL S. CROSS, ed. — *The Workingman in the Nineteenth Century*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1974.

MORDEN LAZARUS. — *Years of Hard Labour: An Account of the Canadian Workingman, his Organization and Tribulations over a period of more than a Hundred Years*. Don Mills: Ontario Federation of Labour, 1974.

The number of publications about the Canadian labour movement and working conditions continues to increase. The object, of course, is to stimulate interest and knowledge of this important element of Canadian society. The four books reviewed include a book of documents on the workingman, a history of the workingman's organization and difficulties for the past 100 years, and two works which concentrate on labour-management conflicts resulting in strikes. Thus they offer a broad spectrum of labour activities.

*The Workingman in the Nineteenth Century* is part of a series being produced by Oxford University press on Canadian social history. It is, according to Professor Michael Cross, "designed to serve as an introduction to the study of the workingman in the nineteenth century" (p. 1).

In this selection of documents, we are told, "the interested reader will find enough documents on enough aspects of working-class life to begin the process of re-thinking our history from the bottom-up" (p. 1). Included in the collection are excerpts from books, articles, newspapers, government reports and a few diaries, which illustrate the different facets of the working class existence.

The book is divided thematically into five sections: "Farm and Frontier" provides information on the problems of the agrarian workers, "Work" includes material on working conditions as industrialization develops; "Working-class Life" and "The Workingman and Social Institutions," the two briefest sections of the book, offer insights into the workingman's existence and his part in the institutionalization of Canadian society; "Organizing the Workingman," the longest section, concentrates on how workers attempted to organize and the reaction of management and government to such activity.

It is difficult to quarrel with an editor's selection of a book of documents, but nonetheless there are problems with this selection which is weighted with relatively accessible material. Furthermore the last, and presumably the most significant, section ignores a number of important factors. No mention is made of the farmers' organizations, such as the Grange of the 1870's and 1880's and the Patrons of Industry in the 1890's whose membership was greater than the labour organizations considered. The first-class analysis of perhaps the largest strike of the nineteenth century, Ed. McKenna's "Unorganized Labour versus Management: the Strike at the Chaudiere Lumber Mills, 1891" *Histoire Sociale/Social History*,