

groupe paysan. D'ailleurs les liens seigneuriaux sont loin de se relâcher. La société rurale tend à se stratifier et relègue cet égalitarisme au rang des figures de style. Également important ici, c'est l'insistance que L. Dechêne, à la suite de plusieurs historiens qui ne sont pas tous traditionnels, met sur la famille en tant qu'institution fondamentale. Les conséquences de cette situation, qu'on ne saurait masquer en parlant de *modernité*, sont peu explorées dans *Habitants et marchands de Montréal* mais elles sont capitales pour qui veut comprendre la lente évolution du Canada français.

Habitants et marchands de Montréal au XVII^e siècle doit son importance à son approche globale et au fait que ce livre touche à la plupart des problèmes que se posent les historiens, ici et ailleurs, depuis une vingtaine d'années. Néanmoins cette œuvre comporte de très sérieuses lacunes méthodologiques qui proviennent sans doute du besoin qu'a l'auteur de réfuter mais aussi du petit nombre d'années consacrées à cette recherche et à sa maturation.

Fernand OUELLET,
Université d'Ottawa

* * *

JOHN J. MANNION. — *Irish Settlements in Eastern Canada: A Study of Cultural Transfer and Adaptation*. University of Toronto Department of Geography Research Publication no. 12, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1974.

This book is a specialized study of selected elements in the material culture of pre-famine migrants from the south and south-east of Ireland. They settled between 1810 and 1835 in rural communities in three provinces: on the Avalon Peninsula of Newfoundland; on the Barnaby river, a tributary of the Miramichi, in New Brunswick; and in three townships near Peterborough, Ontario. The cultural traits considered are settlement patterns and field systems; farm technology, tools and techniques; and farm houses and out buildings.

Despite the restricted nature of its subject, Dr. Mannion's book has a wider significance as a new approach to the reconstruction of pioneer living conditions. Historians have explored the literary record over many years. In Ontario, there is a tradition stretching at least from J.J. Talman's thesis "Life in the Pioneer Districts of Upper Canada 1815-1840" and Guillet's *Early Life in Upper Canada* in the 1930's to Kenneth Kelly's recent articles on wheat farming. *Irish Settlements in Eastern Canada* is based primarily on field work. Dr. Mannion has used his training as an historical geographer and as a student of Irish folk life to introduce the evidence of material survivals and of interviews and questionnaires designed to tap the folk memory and traditions of the older, male inhabitants of his communities. Such new evidence is particularly welcome in the case of poor Irishmen from the Catholic south, a class of settlers who frequently received short shrift from contemporary observers.

The organization of this book shows signs of being too close to the thesis from which it was written. While the survey of the literature of European ethnic group settlement in North America in Chapter 1 (Section 1 of the Bibliography) may have been necessary to justify a micro-study as the subject of a thesis, its isolation from the rest of the book is illustrated by the absence of further reference to any of the works described in either text or footnote. The literature and research techniques which Dr. Mannion apparently used, those of field studies in Ireland and of a smaller body of works touching on the material culture of rural settlements in Canada and the United States, are relegated, along with his own assumptions and methods, to a brief mention in the preface. The remaining chapters are topical. The homeland practice is described first, followed by Newfoundland, New Brunswick and Ontario, the area of least Irish influence, and by a summary which includes a discussion of possible New World borrowings. Newfoundland, and especially

the isolated Cape Shore, supply the best examples of continuance and receive the fullest attention. But, the results of Dr. Mannion's comparisons are remarkable for the extent of change and, most of all, for the differences which emerge between study areas.

As there were cases in which the break with Ireland was complete and immediate, the explanation of the differences between study areas provides the real, continuing theme of the book. The author believes that the rural economy of an area is supremely important in determining the kinds of farm and farming practice which will emerge after the initial stage of subsistence farming. Each of his Irish settlements, and even communities within them, had a different economic base and this is probably the reason for choosing them. Within this context, Dr. Mannion uses variables such as available markets or the attraction of part-time fishing or lumbering to build a convincing explanation for his findings. The other factors he stresses, in order of descending importance, are the pattern of ethnic settlement and the degree of contact, or lack of it, with other ethnic groups; the physical environment and the opportunities for farming it offered; and the emigrants' social and economic background. His sources are least suited to the discussion of social factors. For example, a stronger case could be made for kinship and acquaintance among the assisted settlers of Peterborough than is presented on page 17. Issues such as the dislocation suffered by new emigrants arise as constants in the background and not as questions to be posed for each study area.

Irish Settlements in Eastern Canada is not an easy book to start, partly because of the unfortunate first chapter. Once he is into his main subject in Chapter III, Dr. Mannion's descriptions are clear and his marshalling of factors bearing on each case of survival or change is easily followed. The figures, generally limited to features which differed in one or more of the study areas, are very useful and reflect the author's overall care and attention in presenting the results of his field work. As the treatment is systematic to the point of occasional repetition — the vegetables planted on page 89 appear again with spades and "lazy-beds" on page 109 — readers interested in a particular feature should find it without difficulty. As a whole, the book is of interest to anyone, geographer or historian, working with rural settlements of the first half of the nineteenth century.

Wendy CAMERON.

* * *

Thunder Bay District, 1821-1892: A Collection of Documents. Edited with an introduction by ELIZABETH ARTHUR. Ontario Series of the Champlain Society, No. 9. The Champlain Society for the Government of Ontario. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973.

This is an interesting and valuable volume in an increasingly useful series providing documentary background for the study of Ontario history. It is particularly interesting and valuable in that it provides such background for the little known north and west of the province. Apart from the novelty of the subject, there are two first impressions likely to be made on any reader.

The first is the wealth and variety of surviving historical source material relating to an area that was not at the time a major focus of Canadian or Imperial interest. There are documents from a number of federal and Ontario government departments and from the corporations of the cities of Port Arthur and Fort William. There are papers of the Hudson's Bay Company, the American Fur Company, the Algoma Silver Mining Company, the Canadian Pacific Railway, and many other business groups associated with the district at one time or another. There are letters and diaries of innumerable residents and transients, many of the latter expert observers acting as surveyors for some interest such as the Canadian Pacific Railway or one of several boundary commissions. Among the former were a number of missionaries whose accounts of Indian life, and indeed that of their white parishioners, provide valuable social insights. There were some newspapers and an incred-