

strengths of their mentor. Yet networks are "closed" systems as well. It is to be regretted that, for the most part, the Katzian stable of scholars has not extended its range of interests beyond the province of Ontario, beyond the nineteenth century, and beyond themes that reflect Canadian-American similarities. There are other provinces, there are other centuries, and there are historical developments unique to Canadian education; although such interests are not reflected in *Education and Social Change*, they are being actively pursued by other contemporary researchers.

To be fair, *Education and Social Change* is meant to reflect one stage in the evolutionary development of Canadian educational historiography, a stage reached in the early 1970s. The various authors represented have since gone beyond these "probing and suggestive interpretive essays" (p.v.) to the stage of specialized monographs: for example, Sutherland on childhood at the turn of the twentieth century, and Prentice on Ryerson and other mid-nineteenth-century school promoters. The monograph literature may be further enriched by contributions from other new specializations in Canadian history. What will our new breed of labour historians, women's historians, and historians of popular culture have to say about the relationship between their fields and education? Perhaps a new synthesis is not too far away, a comprehensive history of education in Canadian culture? That would be a logical outcome of the process begun a decade ago by Michael Katz and his students.

Robert M. STAMP,
University of Calgary.

* * *

S.E.D. SHORTT. — *The Search for an Ideal. Six Canadian Intellectuals and their Convictions in an Age of Transition 1890-1930.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1976.

Taking as its point of departure the nineteenth century conflict between idealism and the brand of materialism associated with positivist and empiricist thinkers, this book adds a new depth and texture to our knowledge of Canadian intellectual life. Its examination of the ideas of Andrew Macphail, Archibald MacMechan, James Cappon, and Maurice Hutton will teach readers of it much about Canadian conservatism; they will as well be exposed to an account of social science in Canada as it emerged in the work of Adam Shortt and James Mavor. All of this, moreover, is sketched out in a way that makes clear that Canadian intellectuals moved within a constellation of ideas that was truly international. Hegel, Mill, Comte, Caird, Bergson, and many others figure in these pages, and their presence there is an index of the extent to which the life of the mind in Canada was far from provincial.

This book deals, then, with important and difficult matters; it contains much that is useful and interesting; it does not, however, avoid all the pitfalls involved in a venture of this kind. There is, for example, a certain imprecision in its use of conceptual terms. Empiricism and positivism are not equivalents, and it is inaccurate to speak of them as though they were. If these two terms are sometimes taken to mean the same thing, occasionally the same term is used to mean two things. The word "organic" thus does service not only to describe the quality of the concrete and tangible social relations binding men together in society but also that of the mystical union of all elements in creation in a spiritual whole. More

importantly, the fundamental encounter between materialism and idealism is handled rather loosely. Often the author seems to consider it as having involved little more than the rejection by civilized men of the get and grab commercialism of modern society. Though the components of each of the philosophical systems held by these men is outlined, only an inadequate page or two in the conclusion characterizes the conflict between them. In a book which takes their struggle as its principal theme this seems quite insufficient.

It is, indeed, possible to raise some quite basic questions about the book's organization. These stem largely from the unfortunate decision to cast it in the form of a series of biographical sketches. Some of the argument is, in consequence, lost in biographical detail, while, at other times, the necessity to talk of the principal influences on, and leading ideas of, each of its protagonists means that some elements in that argument are repeated as many as four times. A series of chapters on each of the book's main themes — the character of Christian idealism and the nature of the conflict between it and positivism, the way in which idealists and empiricists alike framed their ideas of the family, society, and government, their sense of the land, their response to industrialism, how they viewed history and defined progress, what characterized the new world of ideas that emerged before, during, and after the Great War — would at once have made its argument more accessible, removed the imbalance between four idealists, one transitional figure, and one empiricist, and made the tension between idealism and empiricism positivism commercialism clearer.

If the architecture of these ideas is not as crisply outlined as it might have been, their relation to the dynamics of their society, and, in particular, to the position those who held them occupied in that society, is passed over with hardly a comment. It is difficult to resist the conclusion that the idealists' celebration of the old order had something to do with status anxieties, and equally hard to see Shortt and Mavor as doing much other than attempting to insure the stability of their society by elaborating an ideology, the acceptance of which would lead to the accomodation and therefore the containment of the new social and economic forces. But whether one accepts this view of the matter or not, some discussion of the issues with which it has to do would have added an essential ingredient to our understanding of these ideas as an active presence in Canadian life.

Allan SMITH,
University of British Columbia.

* * *

HARTMUT FROESCHLE, ed. — *German Canadian Yearbook. Deutschkanadisches Jahrbuch*, vol. 2, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975.

Like its predecessor, this volume is a tribute to its editor's tenacity. The mere act of producing such a volume under the difficult conditions of tenuous private and government financial aid, speaks volumes for his initiative.

Although dated spring 1975, this volume actually appeared much later in 1976. It is handsomely set-up and printed like its predecessor, and again contains a collection of articles in German and English, which try to span the fields of history, sociology, language, literature and culture as they pertain to Germans in Canada. "German" is well defined as applying to people of German language, culture and origins regardless from what country they or their "forebearers" (p. 274) have emigrated to Canada. In his long article on Germans of the prairies, W. Entz