

neurs ne sont pas étudiés comme tels. De temps à autre, leur nom est mentionné à propos de telle ou telle initiative. Le plus souvent, on a le sentiment qu'ils sont dans l'ombre, qu'ils rodent, qu'ils sont les mauvais esprits de cette région, les grands responsables de ses malheurs. Par contre, lorsqu'il s'agit du curé, l'analyse de Séguin est précise et élaborée. Il décrit les bases matérielles du pouvoir clérical: les revenus du curé et ceux de la Fabrique. Le témoignage du pasteur indique que, s'il n'y avait eu le commerce du bois, sorte d'école de libertinage, le Lac St-Jean aurait été un parfait royaume de Dieu. Ce pouvoir du curé s'exerce dans tous les domaines de l'existence. Il est cependant forcé de compromettre avec les laïques, entrepreneurs forestiers et petite bourgeoisie; mais son pouvoir s'exerce d'une façon plus profonde que ne le dit Séguin. Les quelques déviations, les quelques querelles qu'il mentionne ne permettent pas de conclure à un écart entre l'idéologie et la réalité. La petite bourgeoisie est sous la dépendance du curé et les paysans payent la dîme même sur des denrées qui légalement ne sont pas imposables: pomme de terre, foin. Ce qui veut dire que le pouvoir clérical repose sur un consensus et que les incidents dont, il est question dans ce livre, n'affectent pas la solidité de la structure du pouvoir clérical. La religion et la famille apparaissent bien comme des agents d'intégration sociale. Cela n'a rien d'étonnant puisque la région du Saguenay reste jusqu'au début des années 1960 un des endroits où l'emprise cléricale est la plus forte.

Le chapitre sur la petite bourgeoisie est également bien fouillé. Les rapports entre les professionnels: notaire et médecin, les marchands locaux et les marchands de la ville de Québec sont explorés de façon à faire ressortir les liens de dépendance. La main-mise de ces petits bourgeois, sous la surveillance plus ou moins étroite du curé, sur les institutions locales est décrite adéquatement qu'il s'agisse du notaire, de l'instituteur ou du frère du curé Hébert. Dans cette communauté, la spéculation foncière existe: il s'agit d'usuriers ou de marchands qui jouent sur l'endettement pour s'emparer de terres. Ce phénomène est intéressant mais, en aucun cas, il autorise à parler «d'agents du capitalisme foncier». Il est évident que l'existence de cette petite bourgeoisie est commandée jusqu'à un certain point par l'exploitation forestière. Sans celle-ci, le clergé aurait été le maître absolu de la région.

Le livre de Séguin est intéressant à plus d'un titre: une approche globale visant à faire ressortir le caractère exemplaire de sa monographie, une recherche originale sur bien des points. Par contre, les modèles qu'il utilise sont non seulement inadéquats, invérifiables en regard d'une recherche qui néglige par trop le secteur forestier. Fait plus sérieux encore, Séguin, malgré les faits qui les contredisent, n'hésite pas à en affirmer le caractère fécond et l'applicabilité. Cette attitude relève plus de la praxis que de la science.

Fernand OUELLET,
Université d'Ottawa.

* * *

ELIZABETH GRAHAM. — *Medicine Man to Missionary. Missionaries as Agents of Change among the Indians of Southern Ontario, 1784-1867.* Toronto: Peter Martin, 1975.

DAVID H. STYMEIST. — *Ethnics and Indians. Social Relations in a North-western Ontario Town.* Toronto: Peter Martin Associates, 1975.

The study of native-white relations poses serious difficulties for the researcher. Source material is scattered and biased; fair and accurate judgments are

difficult because of cultural differences; a lack of secondary sources makes even knowing where to begin hazardous. Yet such study presents great opportunities for students of social change and cultural interaction. The social sciences possess richly varied methods and perspectives which can illumine these complex topics. The history of French-Huron relations, for example, has benefited from the diverse efforts of scholars such as the archaeologist Wilfred Jury, the anthropologist Bruce Trigger, the historical geographer Conrad Heidenreich and historians Marcel Trudel and Cornelius Jaenen. Social scientists can learn such from each other through interdisciplinary contact. The publication of these two small volumes in the *Canadian Experience Series* is therefore welcome, though the authors have not avoided certain scholarly pitfalls.

Professor Graham sets out to examine the types of changes wrought by missionaries as they laboured among their Indian charges and attempts to analyse the nature of social change in a cross-cultural situation. She concludes that "...processes of change have a life of their own, ...they are not the result of a straightforward amalgamation of two sets of values, nor can they be understood as a simple confrontation between missionaries and Indians." The presentation of evidence to support this conclusion is, however, seriously flawed. The Indians themselves fade into the background of the book, leaving a residue of various white attitudes and actions towards them as its chief subject matter. Interviews with current inhabitants of the communities studied in the monograph might have considerably improved its Indian content. Missionaries do not fare any better than their native counterparts. Except for the earnest Mississauga Methodist Peter Jones, they never become fully identifiable, remaining shadowy figures seen now and again as the too-brief text rushes to its end. The reader is left knowing little more of Indians or of missionaries than when he began.

Accurate portraits of the groups involved in social change are essential if the process itself is to be understood. We must know something of them before contact and we must see them after contact, so that we may grasp the dimensions of cultural interaction. Professor Graham gives us only brief glimpses of Indian society before white contact. Her descriptions of Indian converts' beliefs after the arrival of Christianity are helpful but not enlightening. If the feelings of such people "were not very different from those found in Indian religious systems," they do not seem to have been very different from those of white converts either. Missionary denominations are classified by the extent of their Indian endeavours rather than by their theological beliefs. The reader is left with some uneasy questions. Why were Methodists more active than Anglicans? Why were Roman Catholics late on the missionary scene in southern Ontario? Does the author really understand the different approaches of the various denominations to missions and to Indians?

The book's small size and its lack of secondary sources seem chiefly responsible for these difficulties. Adequately covering the major Indian mission stations of southern Ontario over an eighty-three year period is beyond the capacity of a ninety-two page text. Given such a space limitation, in-depth studies of one or two important reserve communities would be much more satisfying. The exclusion of the Manitoulin settlements — justified on the grounds of space and geography — is curious. Nowhere were missionary hopes higher; nowhere was Indian resistance stronger. Dr. Graham has limited herself to written historical sources, relying chiefly on published government materials and denominational reports. This is acceptable, but there are some serious omissions among the secondary works: G. S. French on the Methodists, Ivison and Rosser on the Baptists, John Henderson, J. J. Talman and T. R. Millman on the Anglicans, for example,

are not listed. More surprisingly, many works on Indians do not appear: R. S. Allen, L.F.S. Upton and R. J. Surtees on the Indian Department, Barbara Graymont and Wilbur Jacobs on Indian diplomacy, and Weaver and Abler's *Canadian Indian Bibliography* are not acknowledged. Much of this material is fairly recent and may not have been available before publication; if so, the book's timing, as well as its size, is unfortunate. Work completed in the last two years such as Donald Smith's study of Peter Jones and Laird Christie's examination of the Caradoc reserve, has done much to increase our understanding of Ontario's Indians and missionaries in the early nineteenth century.

Mr. Stymeist's study of current Indian-white relations in Crow Lake, Ontario, is a happier exercise than *Medicine Man to Missionary*. Based on field-work undertaken in 1971-72, the monograph is not hampered by the space limitations of the *Canadian Experience Series*, though it falls into similar difficulties. Three chapters are spent introducing the material and examining the composition of the non-native population of the town. Natives appear only in one chapter and in the conclusion, leaving the book chiefly concerned with white ethnic divisions.

Stymeist provides useful insights into the nature of a white community with large numbers of Indians nearby. European ethnic divisions seem to become less important the longer white families live in Crow Lake. Whatever differences do survive disappear in the presence of Indians: a "we-they" mentality becomes noticeable. "All non-natives," writes Stymeist, "are considered to be 'white men,' including Chinese, Pakistanis and West Indians." This statement is unfortunately only partially proved. The author spends a great deal of time underlining the sense of common identity among Europeans, but nowhere offers evidence concerning their attitudes towards Asians. One is left wondering if the Crow Lake Europeans really do accept Asians or Africans more readily than natives.

Very little material is provided concerning native communities. Their locations and subdivisions are described, but Stymeist does not appear to have spent any time in them. The only Indians mentioned in the text are those who come into Crow Lake. More material on the local native background is needed, as is more first-hand research. Mr. Stymeist has told us a fair amount about white attitudes towards Indians: what of Indian attitudes towards whites? "Every frontier has two sides," wrote an earlier student of Indian-white relations half a century ago. "To understand fully why one side advances, we must know something of why the other side retreats."

The book is at its best when dealing with the bureaucratic tangles that affect both the natives and the people of the town. Government-funded hospitals treat people for diseases caused by pollution which other government departments refuse to stop. Indian parents, expecting to meet their child at the train station, are confronted instead by his coffin because a bureaucrat forgot to inform them of his death in hospital. Catch-22 comes home with a vengeance in Crow Lake.

Mr. Stymeist's conclusion is surprisingly strong, given his brief treatment of native people. He seems to imply that violent protest is the only answer for Indians caught in such situations. If he had read works by some current native leaders such as George Manuel or Harold Cardinal, he might have reached a different position. Modern Indian leaders know full well that violent revolution has a history of failure in Canada: instead they can use the politico-economic system as skilfully as any white politician to gain their ends.

Professor Graham and Mr. Stymeist are anthropologists — as is the general editor of the *Canadian Experience Series* — and their books reflect their subject's

concern with analytic models. They fall down badly, however, in the gathering and selecting of evidence. Greater attempts should have been made to incorporate both native materials and secondary works by scholars in other disciplines. These books are to be welcomed as attempts to produce secondary sources where few exist. But future scholars of Indian-white relations must strive to produce work that is better researched and more broadly conceived.

Douglas LEIGHTON,
University of Western Ontario.

* * *

MARY BYERS, JAN KENNEDY, MARGARET MCBURNEY. — *Rural Roots. Pre-Confederation Buildings in the York District of Ontario.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1976.

Kenneth McNaught says in his Foreword, "there is no point in trying to categorize this book". That diffusion may be the basis for its successes and for some of its failures. As a picture book it is excellent thanks to the many detailed and sensitive photographs by Hugh Robertson. In general form *Rural Roots* is a collection of local histories held together by geography and a continuing emphasis on old buildings. As a guide book it should be very useful to those who are somewhat familiar with the North York area. As a book on architecture it is often tantalizing; for unless there is a photograph of the building, this book, except in a few cases, tells little about the architecture of any building.

There should be some way, perhaps an asterisk beside the name, in which the buildings which are so well illustrated could be identified in the text since the story is seldom on the same page as the photograph. The authors have wisely selected a wide range of buildings: log cabins and mansions, churches and taverns, mills and general stores, barns and a peacock house. The number and variety of early buildings in this area, many now beautifully adapted to modern use, is remarkable. Robertson's excellent photographs of architectural details and the authors' mention of a single feature, "a particularly fine door", further tantalize the architectural historian, professional or amateur. There are a few strange terms such as "mail order catalogue plan" in 1828?, "barn-shaped house", "the lower storey has been removed"! And it seems the picture on page 165 is merely a different view of that on page 164, not that of the building noted in the caption. But this is mere quibbling for the Junior Leaguers have done a most commendable job following the directions of the late Bill Goulding.

The true *Rural Roots* are in the local histories and the family histories which should delight genealogists. How much is family lore and how much can actually be documented is not clear but the pattern of settlement, the influence of the settlers' backgrounds and their political affiliations come through in every chapter. The separate local history form duplicates much general information and there is some incidental information, a sort of grab bag of interesting stories, which often side tracks the main theme. Maps at the beginning of each local history would help those who are not so familiar with the North York area as those dedicated Junior Leaguers who did the inventory.

Rural Roots joins the growing number of books about Ontario buildings which will provide, at the least, a permanent record of what once was, at the best,