

“social dimension” discussing ritual, discipline, mutual aid, and so forth in greater detail, but there is nothing here that is related to the geographical theme.

Similarly, the authors deal with the “ideological and political dimension” in a separate chapter. This time their treatment is much shorter than Senior’s, though they extend the time period a generation beyond Senior’s limits, to the 1920s, and then consider the Order’s effective demise thereafter. Senior devoted most of his space in *Orangeism: The Canadian Phase* to tracing the changing political nature of Orangeism; Houston and Smyth add little here, and they tell us less about whether the ideology itself evolved. Beyond telling us that the Order still thrives in Newfoundland, they outline this evolution in very simple terms and with little temporal or geographical perspective. Regrettably, they do not relate the ideology of Orangeism, which is best revealed in political action, to the theme of diffusion.

The challenge is to integrate the analysis of cultural diffusion with that of cultural change. This is not an easy task, but Smyth and Houston could have made a start by carrying the theme of regionalism further than they do. They outline the very different reasons for the Orange Order’s strength or weakness in the various provinces, but we need to know the Order’s role in provincial politics outside Ontario and in local politics elsewhere than in Toronto.

Interdisciplinary work often stumbles because of a failure to resolve the differences between the disciplines and to make them work together to achieve a single end. It is this that prevents Smyth and Houston from finding a greater significance underlying the apparent uniformity of the dots on their distribution maps. The authors have already embarked upon a study of Irish settlement in Canada, a topic for which the tools of the historical geographer are well adapted. (Houston and Smyth, “The Irish Abroad: Better Questions Through a Better Source, the Canadian Census”, *Irish Geography*, 13 (1980): 1-19) May we hope to see, at a later stage, a more integrated study of the evolution and diffusion of Irish *mentalité* in a wider context?

Bruce S. ELLIOTT,  
Carleton University.

\* \* \*

DONALD AVERY. — “*Dangerous Foreigners*”: *European Immigrant Workers and Labour Radicalism in Canada, 1896-1932*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1979. Pp. 204.

Until recently, Canadian history has been written as though all Canadians were of Anglo-Saxon or French origin. Immigrants from other cultures have been ignored or shunted into an “ethnic studies” ghetto.

Labour history has been no exception to this tradition. All too many books have been written as though all working people spoke English fluently. It is possible, for example, to find books on the Winnipeg General Strike that offer no hint that a large percentage of the strikers, perhaps a majority, were from Eastern Europe.

Donald Avery’s “*Dangerous Foreigners*” is, therefore, a welcome addition to the literature of labour history in Canada. He focusses on the role that Eastern European workers played in the development of the Canadian labour

movement, and demonstrates that that role was far from minor. Unfortunately, the book promises rather more than it delivers.

The book's subtitle, *European Immigrant Workers and Labour Radicalism in Canada, 1896-1932*, promises a quite comprehensive study. The author, however, backs off from this promise in the first paragraph of the introduction, describing his work first as "a study of European immigration to Canada between the years 1896 and 1931", and then states that the "part which European immigrant workers played in the rapidly changing economic and social life of the country is the central concern here" (p. 7). The value of this approach, he writes, is that it challenges the view that Europeans settled primarily on the land. Then, in a footnote, Avery provided yet another statement of his book's purpose: "This study primarily concentrates on the reaction of the English Canadian community to these European immigrant workers" (p. 7). A few pages later, he tells us that the book concentrates on "the immigrant experience in mining, lumbering, harvesting and railroad construction" (p. 15).

With so many different statements of purpose appearing in the introduction the reader might be excused for concluding that "*Dangerous Foreigners*" is rather uncertain about its reason for being. Further reading tends to confirm that conclusion.

Even accepting the narrowest of the book's self-definitions, there are major omissions: events and developments without which no account of European immigrant labour would be complete. There is, for example, no discussion of the process by which the United Mine Workers union in Alberta and B.C. was destroyed in the 1920s. This union, composed almost entirely of Eastern European immigrants, played a key role in the post-war labour revolt, yet it had vanished completely by 1925. Similarly, the author has nothing to say about the substantial role played by Polish and Ukrainian workers in the massive coal and steel strikes in Cape Breton in the same period.

"*Dangerous Foreigners*" draws on readily available archival collections; its omissions reflect the limits of those collections. There is no other way to account for the book's silence on events of major importance, and its failure to examine in any detail the role of major Eastern European immigrant groups such as the Finns, who dominated the logging industry in Ontario, or the Jews, who dominated the garment trade.

These omissions might be excused if we could have confidence that Avery dealt well with the subjects he does examine. Unfortunately, he is very uncritical in his use of evidence.

In his chapter on the "Red Scare" of 1931-32, for example, he draws extensively on that treasure trove of material on the Communist Party, the Attorney-General's collection in the Provincial Archives of Ontario. This material, seized by the police in raids in 1931, is an invaluable source of material on the internal life of the C. P. Most of it, however, stems from the opening years of the "Third Period", during which the Communist International acted as though revolutions could be created by revolutionary slogans alone. Communist literature from this period is hopelessly unreliable as a source of facts: the Party systematically exaggerated its influence and numbers in its press and in its internal documents. Again and again "*Dangerous Foreigners*" cites C. P. sources for union membership, numbers of deportees, and so on. This uncritical reliance on unreliable evidence diverts attention from a key point: the successful prosecutions of C. P. leaders in 1931 reflect not the Party's strength, but its weakness and its self-isolation from the mainstream of Canadian labour.

"*Dangerous Foreigners*" reflects both the strength and the weakness of Canadian labour history today. Its strength is a determination to uncover and present the history of people too long omitted from the history books, the people who actually built Canada. Its principal weakness is a desire to rush into print without doing the detailed, critical work needed. This book points in the right direction, but it does not travel very far along the road.

Ian ANGUS,  
Toronto.

\* \* \*

IAN ANGUS. — *Canadian Bolsheviks: The Early Years of the Communist Party of Canada*. Montreal: Vanguard Publications, 1981. Pp. xii, 404.

It might not seem immediately apparent that the world needs yet another book on the Canadian Communist Party in the 1920s. Can anything substantial remain to be said after the work of William Rodney, Ivan Avakumovic, Norman Penner and Irving Abella, to say nothing of the successive versions from Tim Buck and his hagiographers?

The answer, according to Ian Angus, is yes. From his Trotskyite perspective, a good deal needs to be added and even more needs to be corrected, particularly in view of Comrade Buck's tireless labour of falsification and distortion. Even those with little ideological engagement in the factional struggles of half a century ago must concede that Angus has performed a service. Readers of the forthcoming official history of the Communist Party of Canada will now be much better equipped for that heavy task if they keep a copy of *Canadian Bolsheviks* by their side.

Angus has a proper scorn for "official histories", a form whose creation he attributes a little unfairly to his Stalinist foes. His most valuable contribution to scholarship is his reminder, not least to the non-Communist historians of Communism, to take nothing for granted, from the claims of Tim Buck to the romanticized achievements of the Workers' Unity League. After fifty years, Buck's attempts to insert himself among the founders of Canadian Communism may have acquired the same absurdity as George IV's conviction that he had fought at Waterloo. It is also a reminder that truth is a very minor virtue in the Orwellian world of Communist historiography.

*Canadian Bolsheviks* would not, of course, have appeared through Vanguard Publications if it was merely a work of detached bourgeois scholarship. It serves its own orthodoxy by providing not so much a history of the Communists in Canada as of the Stalinist deformation which led to the Trotskyite movement. Angus's thesis, simply put, is that the Canadian Communist Party was small but developing nicely under the early Leninist-Trotskyist advice of the Communist International. At Trotsky's insistence, the Communists spurned Bob Russell's One Big Union, avoided the temptation of forming what Lenin scornfully called the "brand new clean little workers' unions" and stayed firmly with the "masses" in the existing organizations. Whatever John L. Lewis and the United Mineworkers might do, the Communists kept the Cape Breton coal-miners in the International. Meanwhile, they penetrated and, in places, dominated the Canadian Labour Party.

The end of this idyllic period of growth and militancy, Angus insists, coincided with the displacement of Trotsky and his allies and the increasingly brutal take-over of Stalinist bureaucrats. Canadian Communists escaped the tragic con-