

Reservations about some interpretations do not mar this truly excellent book, and the factual errors listed above are mere quibbles that can be corrected in the next reprinting. A more substantial concern is the book's chronological balance. Over half of the volume is concerned with the pre-twentieth-century period, which leaves inadequate space for the numerous and complicated events of the twentieth century.

For the past quarter century, Canadian historians have, to a considerable extent, been in the grip of "limited identities." Many have looked down on political history as elitist and have spurned national themes as meaningless. Social history, some of it obsessively ideological, has been in vogue. We have been promised a "new history." Gerald Friesen's book represents a turn of the historiographical wheel. It is at the cutting edge; it is synthetic, ideologically moderate, narrative and includes plenty of politics. Perhaps the "new history" has finally arrived.

Donald SWAINSON
Queen's University

* * *

JOHN WEBSTER GRANT — *Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter Since 1534*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984. pp. xx, 315.

Missionary activity among the native peoples of North America has recently attracted the interest of ethnohistorians. Cornelius Jaenen and Bruce Trigger have broadened our understanding of Canadian missions in the French colonial period. Donald Smith and Elizabeth Graham have examined the nature of the nineteenth-century Protestant experience in Upper Canada. James Axtell has suggested that missions are a convenient historical window through which colonial native-white relations may be studied. The examination of Canadian Indian-missionary relations formed an important component of the Association of Canadian Studies meeting in Toronto in May 1984. Professor Grant's book, appropriately enough, was launched as part of those proceedings.

Moon of Wintertime is an ambitious undertaking which attempts to trace the nature of the Indian-missionary experience from its beginnings in seventeenth-century New France to its transformation in mid-twentieth-century Canada. The breadth of the book is both its greatest strength and its greatest weakness. Professor Grant has avoided the pitfalls of narrow specialization at the expense of scholarly depth. *Moon of Wintertime's* ten chapters cover some 350 years in 266 pages of text. While grateful for such a compact overview, readers will have to go elsewhere for intensive studies of specific missionary communities. Such case studies are, as yet, regrettably few in number.

The book's first three chapters deal with the nature of the missionary experience during the French colonial period. Grant's description of native socio-economic developments prior to white contact is encyclopedic but brief. Several important themes nonetheless emerge in these pages. Short but helpful comparisons of Algonquin and Huron cultures and of Christianity and native religions lead to more fulsome descriptions of French missionary efforts. Grant's analysis of the rivalries amongst the Recollet, Jesuit, Capucin and Sulpician orders is useful. Students of this period are too often presented with an approach that centres on the Hurons and the Jesuits. Mention of these other missionary orders and a geographical focus that includes Acadia and the Five Nations homeland in the Finger Lakes region both help to avoid this traditional narrow perspective. Grant also discusses the impact of the North American experience on the missionary orders themselves, outlining the changes that it wrought in their approach to native peoples. Among the strongest sections of *Moon of Wintertime*, these three chapters, while brief, present a balanced and enlarged perspective on the significance of French missions before 1763.

“Christianity and Civilization” is the well-chosen title of Grant’s pivotal fourth chapter. Concerned with early nineteenth-century missions, it deals with fundamental aspects of post-1815 peacetime Indian policy and prepares the way for the three geographically-oriented chapters which follow. This is familiar territory, for both past denominational panegyrics and more recent critical scholarship have covered Upper Canada in the first half of the nineteenth century. Yet Grant examines this area in refreshingly critical ways, suggesting, for example, that at least some Indians chose to become Christian because conversion opened a path to white society which they wished to follow. He also holds missionary societies responsible for their own failures in the second generation of Indian experience. Gone from Grant’s analysis are both the old stereotype of the missionary as saintly civilizer and the new one of the Indian as simple victim of circumstances. The author sees both groups dynamically involved in historical change. Thoughtful readers will welcome the intellectual challenges posed by Grant in this section of *Moon of Wintertime*, even if they do not accept all of his conclusions.

The three chapters which follow cover the geographical spread of missions into the sub-arctic, the west coast and the prairies respectively. While they contain much useful material — Grant’s geographical capsules and descriptions of denominational rivalries are especially helpful — they are too brief to be really satisfactory. There is a rushed superficiality to these pages which other parts of the book manage to avoid. Grant is careful to note regional variations among natives in their reception of missionaries, observing that there was a particular lack of emotional commitment to the various branches of the new faith evident among plains tribes.

This nineteenth-century geographical survey is brought to a conclusion by an examination of educational methods and types of schools used by missionaries. Day schools, boarding schools and technical education are all analyzed, as are the reasons for their failure to change native cultures in ways that missionaries had expected. Native societies, so fragile in appearance, proved to be amazingly resilient. The failure to produce quick and long-lasting social change among native peoples led to both an unacceptably over-protective paternalism and to a sort of Darwinian pessimism by the end of the century. Indian missions began to lose their place of importance among the various denominations which supported them.

Grant’s last three chapters analyze the reasons for the decline of missions in the early twentieth century and the subsequent revival of interest in Indian rights after 1945. Changed socio-political conditions in many local Indian communities reduced the relative importance of mission stations in them. New foreign mission priorities in the larger denominations, coupled with a rigidity of approach that condemned Indians as perpetual inferiors, undermined the vitality of the enterprise. Since the World War II, the mission situation has become very fluid. The traditional major denominations have tended to champion Indian rights while smaller evangelical and conservative groups have entered the mission scene in a manner reminiscent of the early nineteenth century, ignoring the accumulated wisdom of 150 years of experience.

Grant’s provocative last chapter suggests that Christianity has played a positive role in the preservation of some native cultures. Far from rejecting the new religion, many Indians eagerly converted to it only to find that it contained seeds of destruction for their own traditions. This in turn caused the rise of a truly indigenous Christianity which preserved native traditions within the surface acceptance of the new faith. When resistance occurred, according to Grant, it was not directed at Christianity *per se* but at the threats to native culture it contained. The native acceptance of the new gospel did not mean the rejection of old customs and values. Modern Indian revitalization movements may yet lead to a renewed native Christianity.

It is in this attempt to encourage a critical rethinking of the importance of Christian missions, that *Moon of Wintertime* makes its greatest intellectual contribution to ongoing scholarly debate. There will be much argument over the merits of this book’s fundamental conceptions and interpretations. Much of its material will doubtless be superseded by the work of other writers, as the author himself admits. Some of its specific judgements, such as the over-generous assessment of D.C. Scott (pp. 194-195), will be questioned. But no serious student of the Indian-missionary experience in Canada will

be able to ignore the challenges it contains. John Webster Grant has produced a book that is sometimes superficial and flawed, but one which is nonetheless of fundamental importance in its field.

Douglas LEIGHTON
Huron College

* * *

RONALD HAMOWY — *Canadian Medicine: A Study in Restricted Entry*. Vancouver: The Fraser Institute, 1984. pp. xxii, 394.

Ronald Hamowy's *Canadian Medicine: A Study in Restricted Entry* is not a subtle book. It is an examination of the ways and means by which the medical profession developed a virtual monopoly over regular medicine by the early twentieth century. As he states on page 2,

It does not take a sophisticated knowledge of economic theory to know that such policies as increasing the costs of entry into the profession, limiting the number of new entrants, restricting advertising, discouraging price competition, and defining the ambit of professional practice so as to restrict the availability of substitute services, all redound to the economic benefits of members of a profession.

And just in case the reader forgets, the author hammers the point home again and again throughout the book.

This is not a startling thesis. It has been a mainstay in the literature on professionalization for many years. However, the author argues that it is a new perspective on Canadian medicine. He chastises Canadian medical historiography for being sympathetic to physicians and too accepting of their altruistic rhetoric. It is true that much of the literature has been Whiggish in tone but Hamowy ignores much of the work done in the last five to ten years by academic historians, which is anything but sympathetic to the medical profession. And despite his criticism of the Whiggish work, Hamowy bases much of his discussion of the nineteenth century on it. Not until he addresses the early twentieth century does he utilize primary sources to any great extent.

The book is very narrative in approach. The author traces the steps by which regular practitioners exerted a monopoly but he never puts these steps into any kind of context. He certainly does not identify the social factors which created the atmosphere in which 'professionalization' and monopoly could take place not only for physicians but other groups as well. Ignored is the work by historians who linked the development of institutions to the underlying economic structure. Understandably someone writing for the Fraser Institute may not wish to see the impact of economic changes on this process but that is no reason not to create some explanatory model which is linked to the historical period under examination.

The lack of connection between analysis and social context is frustrating, for the factual information presented (particularly for the nineteenth century) is not really new, although Hamowy has brought some of it together for the first time. The major focus is Ontario and, although the other provinces are examined, the process is so similar in each that the reader becomes mired in detail with little understanding of how or why they differ. For example, Quebec's physicians were incorporated into a college in 1847 but it is noted that those in Ontario had to wait 20 more years. No explanation of this is provided. The book traces the success of the medical lobby but does not analyze why it was so successful. It certainly was not in the public's interest, yet no public outcry occurred. Why was there so little opposition to what was happening? Was the public really so passive? A pet peeve of the author's is the fact that Canadian licensing discriminated against graduates of American medical schools, yet he does not examine what those schools were like. But then in his scenario it does not matter what they were like. His vision is of a medical system where medical care would be offered