

as Joseph Pollock, the "Irish Rousseau", and offers others their first serious consideration by a modern historian. Her treatment of Thomas Russell, Tone's closest friend and confidant, is so thorough that her work will surely be the starting place for Russell's future biographers.

Without doubt, however, the most important, and even compelling aspect of this work is the liberation of Tone and his thought from the polemical trap in which he has long been ensnared. This achievement will certainly win her much criticism from polemicists of all persuasions, but it should be welcomed by every student of Tone, Irish republicanism, and 18th-century society and politics. Those who refuse to recognize this can only do so because they are uncomfortable with the fact that

Tone was a deist who disliked institutionalized religion and sectarianism of any hue; that he had no time for the romantic Gaelicism which has become part of Irish nationalism, and was far less dogmatic about England or the resort to arms than is commonly supposed ...

and, most especially, that "his central message was not that Ireland's abiding evil was England, but rather that her people were disunited." Surely, all readers, with our vantage of two centuries, will be able to see the logic of Tone's greatest Irish understanding: until the problem of sectarianism is solved, the problem of England will remain. "This is why, nearly two hundred years after his death, Wolfe Tone is still a living force in Ireland" (1).

Kevin O'Neill  
*Boston College*

\*\*\*

Alain Erlande-Brandenburg — *La Cathédrale*. Paris: Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1989. Pp. 418.

This work traces the development of the cathedral physically from its fourth-century visible presence in Gaul through the end of the Gothic period. Throughout his study, the author invokes geographic variations, particularly those between northern France and the Midi, although gestures are made periodically to England, Germany, Italy, Spain, and, at times, eastern Europe. The author states that he will scan the major eras of development: emergence and initial organization, Carolingian impact, Romanesque revisions, and Gothic *épanouissement*. Focusing on topographic evolution, Erlande-Brandenburg centers the cathedral squarely in its urban context with attention to the spiritual and political dynamics of each succeeding era. This study is a synthesis of recent and more venerable research, at times elucidating archeological findings through confrontation with written records.

The author opens his work with an illuminating examination of the nineteenth-century rediscovery of Gothic architecture, exploring the spiritual vision of Victor Hugo and the practical and aesthetic impact of Viollet-le-Duc in the general context of "mythification de la 'cathédrale'" (13). Moving on to his medieval topic, Erlande-Brandenburg correctly presents the cathedral as an urban phenomenon of singular importance in its many manifestations over the centuries. Numerous sketches and layout plans help to anchor the author's arguments. However, the result of new research will be difficult for the concerned reader to pursue, given the lack of specific

footnotes and the cursory, and somewhat parochial, bibliographic orientation. Thus, from the perspective of an urban medieval historian such as this reviewer, the visual emphasis conveys immediacy to the topic, but the data are extremely dense and the sources almost unrecoverable.

In the growing uncertainty of late imperial life, Roman cities experienced fortification with a corresponding reduction in surface area. The cathedral was translated inside the wall with ensuing disruption or destruction of public monuments and roads. The result of the process was the creation of a holy city within the urban walls. Following Henri-Irénée Marrou, Erlande-Brandenburg accepts an argument of continuity across the second through the tenth centuries with a break coming not in the Carolingian era, but rather, due to Norman invasions, in the tenth century.

The Carolingian contribution involved the occidentalization of churches, the well-studied Westwerk. With eleventh-century ecclesiastical reform and the appearance of the communal movement, the cathedral group of the earlier period, at least two churches and a baptistry, was abandoned. New cathedral functions were highlighted: diocesan and pilgrimage roles as at Le Puy, Compostella and Chartres. The placement of new cathedral churches in growing cities became a matter of concern. The Romanesque church emerged out of these tensions and then was rather quickly superseded in some cases by the Gothic cathedral.

The Gothic experience understandably receives the author's heaviest focus. In a valuable exploration of urban experience during construction, the process of expansion of the Romanesque church to the Gothic cathedral is painstakingly related in case after case. For a hundred years, a huge Gothic choir might coexist with a tiny earlier nave as the larger construction went forward. Various options for expansion were adopted, according to the specific topographic constraints in different towns. Eastward expansion through the old walls, rarely witnessed in the Romanesque era, was undertaken in the relative peace of the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries. A *parvis*, however small, was carved out in front of the cathedral to permit massing of the faithful. The elaboration of the harmonious western portal was possible in some cases, but not in all, due to building constraints. Access for the faithful was at times on the south or the north. Ingenious solutions to previous urban patterns of movement were sometimes incorporated into the larger Gothic structure: the persistence of a roadway through the cathedral of Lausanne.

The aesthetic vision of builder-bishops and architects was not to the liking of every urban dweller, and Erlande-Brandenburg makes analogy to the recent debate over the Pyramide du Louvre. In a very intriguing discussion of architectural controversy, Erlande-Brandenburg reproduces Pierre Lavadin's transcription of the debate about one or three naves for Gerona, a topic which he could have pursued further in the work of American art historian Vivian Paul on the appearance of the *nef unique* in the south of France. Other architectural debates can be traced in the final architectural solutions of cathedrals such as Strasbourg and Prague.

The author studies at some length the financial underpinning of cathedral building in the Gothic era. No royal patronage was forthcoming in France in contrast to other realms. Bishops subsidized the building program, and local urban corporations in towns like Chartres contributed as well. Documentation for the financial institution of the *fabrique* with canonical and lay participation is available in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. Not only the cathedral itself, but the surrounding structures, episcopal palaces, canonical enclosures, cloisters, chapels, towers,

*hôtels-Dieu* are investigated. The author addresses the challenges in the creation of a holy quarter with reference to the available contemporary architectural documents and methods in France during the Gothic period, discussing, for example, the preservation of wooden sculptural models, the “gabarits”. Further in this vein, he relates the results of a recent study which interprets the sketch book of Villard de Honnecourt as a possible recopying of the assortment of designs at one “chantier”.

On balance, though devoid of critical apparatus, this is a useful work in its treatment of the cathedral as an organic part of the city. My quarrels are with format more than with foundations, though the two are inevitably interrelated for the professional audience. For the admirer of medieval cathedrals, the author makes a significant contribution to our general knowledge.

Kathryn Reyerson  
University of Minnesota

\*\*\*

E. Estyn Evans — *Irish Folk Ways*. London and New York: Routledge, 1957; reprint, 1988. Pp. 324.

This sixth reprinting of E. Estyn Evans' *Irish Folk Ways* underscores the work's deserved reputation as the classic book on the subject. While more specialized studies of Irish folklore have appeared in the last three decades, Professor Evans' masterful introductory survey of traditional Irish rural life has not been superseded or significantly contradicted. Professor Evans combined extensive professional background as an ethnographer, geographer, and archaeologist with years of personal observation and conversations throughout Ireland to compile this amply illustrated and beautifully written study.

Professor Evans declares his subject to be “the living past” (xiii). He emphasizes how essential an historical sense is to a geographer, who is interested primarily in variations in space rather than time, “without a knowledge of the past, he will not fully observe the present” (xiii). His own words eloquently express the value of his research:

Nothing less than the whole of the past is needed to explain the present, and in this difficult, task we cannot afford to neglect the unrecorded past. The crafts of arable farming, of animal husbandry and the home industries have done more to shape our instincts and our thoughts than the trampling of armies or the wranglings of kings which fill the documents from which history is written (xiv).

*Irish Folk Ways* focuses on the material and customary traditions of rural Ireland. Although the literary and musical dimensions of Irish folklore are outside the scope of the book, Professor Evans is keenly aware of how closely intertwined the artifacts and customs are with the traditional beliefs and world view which permeated all aspects of Irish folklore. Moreover, the broad range of Professor Evans' own interests is repeatedly apparent, as when he points out how the traditional association of fertility and decay, of life and death, so apparent in household, farming, and life-cycle customs is also central in the works of recent Irish dramatists.