

BCCLA, and it would be most useful for readers who are interested in civil liberties in comparative perspective. One can safely assume their number is growing, especially in Europe nowadays.

Elazar Barkan
California Institute of Technology

Alfred P. Smyth — *Warlords and Holy Men: Scotland AD 80-1000*. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 1989. Pp. viii, 279.

G.W.S. Barrow — *Kingship and Unity: Scotland 1000-1306*. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 1989. Pp. 185.

Olive and Sydnor Checkland — *Industry and Ethos: Scotland 1832-1914*. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 1989, Pp. 232.

David McCrone, Stephen Kendrick and Pat Straw, eds. — *The Making of Scotland: Nation, Culture and Social Change*. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press in conjunction with the British Sociological Association, 1989. Pp. 234.

The first three books listed above are welcome reissues of titles which were originally published by Edward Arnold in 1984 as part of "The New History of Scotland" series, while the fourth is drawn from among papers presented at the annual meeting of the British Sociological Association held in March 1988. Taken together, they cover a remarkably wide sweep of chronological eras and societal issues, while also illustrating the wealth and diversity of methodological approaches that can be usefully applied to the Scottish past.

In *Warlords and Holy Men*, Alfred P. Smyth assays one of the most difficult periods in Scottish history. The historian of the Early Middle Ages in Scotland is faced not only with a paucity of documentary — or even narrative — evidence, but also with a multiplicity of peoples — and linguistic groups — whose complex interactions are the basis for any clear understanding of the period. As earlier reviewers of Dr. Smyth's works have noted, he does not shy away from controversy, and, here, he begins by arguing forcefully that there was virtually no Romanization in the Pennines, and that the Anglian (English) influence on the Britons (in Scotland) was minimal.

Having rejected a Roman starting point for the study of Caledonia, Smyth turns his attention to the problem of the Picts, a veritable minefield of controversy. He views the term Pict as cultural rather than linguistic, and, therefore, sees it as useful, placing the Picts in a Celtic milieu. As the Pictish regions of the 4th through 9th centuries were already Celtic by the 1st century, he places much greater emphasis on Irish influence than on that arising from contacts with the Anglo-Saxons. Smyth also argues against the tradition of matrilineal descent among the Picts, instead pointing to "a strong cognatic element in Celtic royal succession" (68).

In his chapters on Columba and Adomnán, Smyth places early medieval Scotland very firmly in a Celtic Christian milieu. If Columba was not perhaps as fully the "apostle of the Picts" as usually described, he was nevertheless a tireless spiritual warrior and founder of monasteries, whose personal connections with the Uí Néill highkings drew the Irish Dál Riata and Scots Dál Riata into an even closer affinity

with its focal point in Iona. The powerful position bequeathed to Iona by Columba is clearly illustrated in Smyth's discussion of the life and career of Adomnán, whose Law of Innocents was recognized by Scottish, Irish, Pictish and British rulers alike, despite the fact that he had accepted the Roman rite at Jarrow in 685.

In his discussion of the role of Vikings in the formation of the Scottish nation, Smyth once again offers controversial interpretations. His portrayal of the Vikings is noteworthy for the level of violence which he ascribes to them, in contrast to much recent writing on the subject. Of even greater interest is his discussion of the Hebridean element in the settlement of Iceland, and the suggestion that the Vikings were likely led thither (and possibly beyond) by the Celtic *papar*. Finally, Smyth argues that it was these violent Norsemen who provided the occasion for the actual birth of Scotland. The Scandinavian stranglehold over the sea, the wedge they drove between the Scots and Irish, resulted in a geographical shift to the east and a growing "Scottish" awareness. In Kenneth MacAlpin, we find a king of both Scots and Picts, and the new orientation is well illustrated in the new Christian cult centers in the east, such as St. Andrews, which quickly came to rival Iona, which itself witnessed the removal of the relics of St. Columba at this time. The consolidation of the southern uplands was subsequently achieved — again with indirect assistance from the Vikings — by a process in which Strathclyde was recognized as a sub-kingdom for the heir to the Scottish throne, while elsewhere, tribal rulers were transformed into the king's men, the *mormaers*.

Warlords and Holy Men concludes with a chronological table which students will find useful and a very good bibliography which might, however, have been updated at the time of reissue. Smyth's volume is followed in the series by Professor G.W.S. Barrow's *Kingship and Unity*, which takes the story of Scotland down to the War of Independence and Robert Bruce's accession to the throne in 1306.

Surveying a narrower field, both geographically and chronologically, Barrow's is a much more straightforward and far less controversial text than Smyth's. In eight chapters, the author surveys the geography of medieval Scotland, kings and kingship, Scottish feudalism, the Church, burghs and burgesses, the integration of the kingdom as a whole, physically and then socially, and finally, Scotland's place in medieval Europe.

Perhaps the most significant feature of the period between 1000 and 1306 in Scotland was a reorientation away from the Scandinavian world and towards the south, England and the continent. Barrow sees the decisive turning point in this development as the marriage of Malcolm III Canmore to St. Margaret, daughter of Edward the Atheling, in 1068. This fruitful marriage brought in its train a number of further political marriages and drew the Scottish crown into close relations with the new Norman kingdom to the south. Under Malcolm's sons, Alexander I and David I, feudalism was introduced into Scotland, especially south of the Clyde-Forth line, and with it a new type of kingship, predominantly territorial rather than tribal in nature.

The twelfth and thirteenth centuries also witnessed a transformation of the Scottish church. Not only was a diocesan and parochial system introduced throughout the kingdom, but Scotland's ecclesiastical autonomy was guaranteed by the papacy, which declared the Scottish church to be its "special daughter", free from the intervention of any outside metropolitan authority, such as York or Trondheim. The same period also saw the royal introduction of numerous monastic and quasi-monastic orders, notably the Augustinians and Cistercians, as well as the building of splendid

cathedrals which served as physical embodiments of the new currents flowing into Scotland from the south.

The Scottish connection with the papacy was to be of great importance in the coming struggle with England. So, too, were the lines of communications opened up to the continent in these years by Scottish burgesses in their pursuit of trade. The development of the burghs, with their special relationship to the crown, was yet another factor in creating a Scottish nation, and their burgesses' wealth helped the kings not only to fight their southern wars, but also to incorporate the northern and western peripheries within their realms. By the end of the thirteenth century, Barrow argues, Scotland had emerged as a distinct, unified kingdom, capable of withstanding the challenge of its aggressive English rivals.

The two books already considered deal with the formative period in Scottish history, but we must now turn our attention to two other books which examine the making of the modern Scottish nation. *Industry and Ethos*, by Olive and Sydney Checkland, falls much more clearly within the compass of social history than the two volumes previously discussed, being far more concerned with questions of social groups and conditions than with institutions. While this is in large part a function of the nature and extent of the available sources, it is also clearly a conscious choice on the part of the authors.

Scotland as it emerged during the industrial age, the Checklands argue, was a product of the amalgamation of the Union of 1707, Calvinism, and natural resources. They begin their discussion of how industrialization and urbanization affected Scottish life by presenting a comparison of the four great cities — Edinburgh, Glasgow, Aberdeen and Dundee — followed by consideration of the changing rural scene. Having thus set the stage, the following chapters deal with the Scottish working classes; welfare and education; religion, morals and social responsibility; and the intellect, the arts and sciences. A recurring theme of these chapters is the significance of the Disruption of 1843 and the difficulties of the established church, except the Roman Catholic Church, effectively to reach the working classes. Also stressed is the growing nostalgia for the rural past, evoked not only in art and literature which ignored the reality of industrialization, but in the growth of Highland games. The Checklands conclude with several chapters devoted to the question of Scottish identity, both within Britain and abroad, for the nineteenth century saw tremendous emigration from Scotland, particularly to North America. The Checklands argue that the Scots felt "a sense of distinctiveness that did not require the assertion of separateness" (198). At least not politically.

The present second edition of *Industry and Ethos* includes not only corrections, but also an entirely new chapter devoted to "Women: Hopes and Aspirations". As in the case of other volumes in the "New History of Scotland" series, this book concludes with a useful chronological table and suggestions for further reading, although again, updating the bibliography would have been helpful.

While many of the same issues are discussed, a somewhat different approach to post-industrial Scottish society is found in *The Making of Scotland*, a collection of twelve essays in historical sociology. Although the editors of the volume remark that "studying Scotland is not a good career move" (2), they have nevertheless brought together a series of highly informative and stimulating essays, all of which are concerned in some fashion with questions of the Scottish national identity.

In many ways, *The Making of Scotland* serves as both a complement and a corrective to the Chekland volume, the contributors here being able to consider specific issues in far greater detail. For example, Linda Mahood's excellent essay, "The Domestication of 'Fallen' Women: The Glasgow Magdalene Institution, 1860-90", argues that the magdalene institutions in Scotland, non-statutory female penitentiaries, in effect "constituted a technology of power; a social control apparatus designed for the surveillance, sexual and vocational control and moral reform of a segment of the female working-class population" (145). It presents a stark contrast to the more positive picture of women's gains presented by the Checklands. Similarly, the question of the uniqueness of Scotland's national identity within Britain is examined in detail in three consecutive essays, notably the somewhat combative exchange between Tony Dickson and Steve Kendrick. Other contributors focus on the position of the working classes and professional classes in nineteenth-century Scotland, Shetland in the world economy, and the writings of Adam Ferguson.

The depiction of Scotland is the theme of the final four essays in the collection. In "Representing Scotland: Culture and Nationalism", David McCrone assails Tartanry and Kailyard as mythic structures offering "only negative representations of Scotland, reflecting the political and cultural developments since the Union of 1707" (161). S. Bruce and S. Yearly follow this with an examination of "The Social Construction of Tradition: The Restoration Portraits of the Kings of Scotland" in which they argue that James, Duke of Albany, used the De Wet portraits in Holyroodhouse to transform a national myth into a royalist myth. Next, in "Culture, Social Development and the Scottish Highland Gatherings", Grant Jarvie traces four periods in the development of Highland Gatherings. The first, to c.1750 was a developmental phase. The second, from c.1745 to c.1850, saw the games exported and "influenced by processes of cultural marginalization and transformation" (204). The third phase, which Jarvie terms Balmoralization, lasted from c.1840 to c.1920 and saw the romanticization of the Gatherings. The fourth phase, down to the present, has seen modernization and even a move towards professionalization. *The Making of Scotland* concludes with sports sociologist H.F. Moorhouse's presentation, "'We're off to Wembley.' The History of a Scottish Event and the Sociology of Football Hooliganism". What is perhaps most interesting in this fascinating essay is not some attempt to define hooliganism or isolate its causes, but rather to question the very existence of "violence" on behalf of Scottish fans at Wembley in light of an historical survey of media accounts going back to 1891.

Separated as they are by time and disciplinary orientation, each of the volumes under review here nevertheless has much to offer to the student of Scottish social history. Taken together, they provide many insights into the paradox of modern Scotland, a nation but not a state.

J.S. Hamilton
Old Dominion University
