

bénéficier avantageusement d'un traitement plus conséquent. Sans aller jusqu'à une édition critique, nous aurions apprécié connaître la présentation matérielle de ces documents et les procédures ayant mené à l'établissement des textes présentés. Les « fautes » relevées, notamment à la page 181 (*arborigène* pour aborigène, *procuer* pour procurer) peuvent laisser croire à un souci, de la part de Castonguay, de respecter le manuscrit original. L'absence de *[sic]* ne permet malheureusement pas de le dire avec précision.

Malgré ces quelques imperfections, que l'on peut considérer comme mineures dans le cadre d'un ouvrage qui se veut en premier lieu biographique, le livre de Castonguay pourra être apprécié par un public diversifié et deviendra sans doute le nouvel ouvrage de référence pour ceux qui s'intéresseront à la vie de Philippe Aubert de Gaspé, seigneur et homme de lettres.

Vincent Dubost

Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières

Colin Howell and Richard Twomey, eds. — *Jack Tar in History: Essays in the History of Maritime Life and Labour*. Fredericton, N.B.: Acadiensis Press, 1991. Pp. 275.

Jack Tar in History is intended as a “voyage of discovery”. The reader’s journey, as editors Colin Howell and Richard Twomey envision it, will be dually discursive. First, in lieu of a comprehensive tour of the scholarly traditions of maritime labour history, the book offers a peripatetic junket to “a variety of seafaring worlds — some only recently discovered” (p. 7). This exploration of the nature and scope of Jack Tar’s existence is carried out in tandem with an exploration of method. Many of the essays collected in this volume, most of which were culled from a recent scholarly conference, seek to chart new historiographical territory or to expose links between the history of seafaring labourers and “much larger social, political and historical processes” (p. 9). All of the contributors, in different ways and settings, participate in the process of reconstructing — what one essay memorably terms “remembering” (p. 12) — eighteenth- and nineteenth-century maritime history by giving voice, body, roots, context, and *mentalité* to the seafarers themselves.

The breadth of the collection is notable. Of the 13 essays, only one, a study of the British Naval Mutinies of 1797 by Joseph Price Moore III, examines “authentic Jack Tars” — the British naval seamen who gave rise to the epithet. Seafaring labourers on commercial vessels are well represented, and the experiences of non-British (largely Canadian and American), black, and female sailors are all addressed. The volume, moreover, devotes as much attention to the consciousness of sailors as to their material circumstances, and reconstructions of “the world ashore” dominate portrayals of life at sea. Not surprisingly, such tremendous topical diversity threatens the coherence of the volume, even as it serves the ends of exploration and discovery. This difficulty is alleviated somewhat by the book’s thematic organization — essays are divided among five sections dealing with revolution, law,

gender, naval forces, and industrialization. Still, the ability of the essays to inform one another remains limited, particularly given the brevity of the editors' foreword and the absence of conference keynote addresses by Jesse Lemisch and Alfred Young.

All of the essays collected in *Jack Tar* are sufficiently provocative to merit more detailed comments than are possible here. Nevertheless, a few brief remarks directed toward each may suffice to show that the contributions are as diverse in quality and approach as they are in subject. Particularly strong are two essays included in the section on gender and seafaring. Utilizing documents related to nineteenth-century struggles over the adequacy and allotment of seafarers' wages, Valerie Burton finds that British merchant seamen began to perceive the oppressive aspects of the Jack Tar myth (namely that it could be used by shipowners to justify low and judiciously allotted wages) at a time when changing gender norms made "family provision ... the touchstone of masculinity" (p. 181). Issues of status and masculinity are central as well to Margaret Creighton's analysis of the social construction of maleness aboard nineteenth-century American merchant vessels. Creighton's examination of 200 seafaring diaries unearths a variety of "modes of masculinity" (p. 147) that mediated sailors' relationships with their compatriots and the women in their lives. At the periphery of this analysis, and unfortunately less well developed, are observations regarding interactions of class, race, and gender in the formation of ship-board hierarchies. A third consideration of seafaring and gender, Lisa Norling's study of the diminution of maritime women's status in nineteenth-century Nantucket, is well documented, but the author's effort to explain the process in terms of "sentimentalization" is ultimately more restricting than illuminating.

If Norling's contribution oversimplifies, Peter Linebaugh's and Marcus Rediker's examination of seafaring's radical traditions errs in the opposite direction. Linebaugh and Rediker examine four revolutionary moments in the history of seafaring labourers, including the American Revolution and the Gordon Riots, in an attempt to document "a broad cycle of rebellion in the eighteenth-century Atlantic world" (p. 35). The argument is an intriguing one, but the evidence presented for an eastward, trans-Atlantic circulation of revolutionary consciousness proves rather circumstantial. A more compact and ultimately more compelling treatment of the transmission of radical ideals is offered by Moore in his study of ship to ship (and eventually fleet to fleet) communication during the Great Mutinies of 1797. Rebellious behaviour is also the subject of the essays by Nicholas Rogers and Julius Scott. Rogers makes use of Admiralty and journalistic records to chart British opposition to impressment during the American Revolution. Not least of Rogers's contributions is his illustration of the commensurability of the manpower needs of the Admiralty with the disciplinary needs of port employers. Scott's essay returns to the theme of Atlantic-as-conduit-of-radicalism through a study of an eighteenth-century Afro-American sailor. Relying upon admittedly scanty resources, Scott makes broad claims regarding the general liberating qualities of seafaring and the particular radicalizing effects of the Haitian Revolution.

Not all of the essays in *Jack Tar* are primarily concerned to reconstruct the consciousness of seafarers. Sean Cadigan, for example, examines the role played by the wages and lien system in the decline of wage labour in the Newfoundland

fishery of the early nineteenth century. While Cadigan devotes too little attention to the questions of underdevelopment he raises, his careful research illuminates the intricate legal and productive relations that governed merchants, planters, and servants. Three other essays by Del Muise, James Pritchard, and Ira Dye aim quantitative methods at Jack Tar. As part of a larger study of the effects of industrialization in the Maritimes, Muise uses census data to trace changes in the nature of Yarmouth's seafaring workforce between 1871 and 1921. His explications of landward transitions in local employment are usefully situated within Yarmouth's broader social and economic history. Pritchard likewise acknowledges the value of context, linking his estimation of the size of the 1746 French expedition to Acadia to studies examining the socio-economic origins of the force. Regrettably, the most technically impressive of the quantitative essays — Dye's reassemblage of American seafarers from prisoner-of-war records kept by Britain during the War of 1812 — does not follow suit. Dye never suggests what use might be made of the profiles he develops and thus the import of his findings remains unclear.

The two remaining essays, Dianne Dugaw's examination of balladic "women warriors" and Eric Sager's consideration of the value of sailors' "oral reminiscences" as historical sources, are substantially methodological and fit somewhat uneasily in subject and approach with the other writings collected. Nevertheless, these essays are indicative of some of the strengths and flaws of the anthology as a whole. On one hand, Dugaw and Sager represent the vanguard of their field: their innovative contributions argue convincingly for breadth both in conceptualizations of Jack Tar and in sources for seafaring life and labour. On the other, both authors neglect to articulate the *raison d'être* of their research — that is, its historical or historiographical significance. This omission, one shared by many of the contributions, hampers the volume's capacity to communicate developments within the field of maritime history to a general scholarly audience. A journey through *Jack Tar* is likely to be most fruitful for those with established interests in seafaring history or in history "from the bottom up". The non-specialist may just feel adrift.

Lisa M. Sullivan
Harvey Mudd College

Betsy Dewar Boyce — *The Rebels of Hastings*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992. Pp. 233.

The rebellions of 1837–1838 in Upper Canada are well suited as subjects of popular history, given the common view that they are among the few exciting events in this country's supposedly otherwise dull past. More than a few prospective readers will wonder, however, how a history of the rebellion years in the eastern Ontario county of Hastings can comprise an entire book. The rebellions of 1837 occurred nowhere near Hastings and its chief centre, Belleville, nor did the most celebrated of the related events of 1838 and 1839, including the burning of the *Caroline* near Niagara and the invasion of Windsor.